

McCARTER & ENGLISH, LLP

Four Gateway Center

100 Mulberry Street

Newark, New Jersey 07102

(973) 622-4444

Attorneys for Defendant/Third-Party

Plaintiff Commonwealth Land Title Insurance Company

DK-4593 (David R. Kott, Esq.)

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY

-----X

WALSH SECURITIES, INC., :  
v. Plaintiff, : Civil Action No. 97-3496  
CRISTO PROPERTY MANAGEMENT, LTD., : Honorable William G. Bassler  
et al., :  
Defendants. : CERTIFICATION OF SERVICE  
and :  
COMMONWEALTH LAND TITLE INSURANCE :  
COMPANY, :  
Defendant/Third Party Plaintiff, :  
v. :  
ROBERT WALSH and ELIZABETH ANN :  
DeMOLA, :  
Third Party Defendants. :  
-----X

DESIREE JACKSON, in lieu of affidavit under oath, says:

1. I am employed by the law firm of McCarter & English, LLP, attorneys for Defendants/Third Party Plaintiffs, Commonwealth Land Title Insurance Company, in this action.
2. On June 3, 2005, I caused to be delivered a copy of Third Party Plaintiff Commonwealth Land Title Insurance Company's Brief in Opposition to Third Party Defendant Weichert, Realtors Motion to Dismiss, As It Relates to Commonwealth Land Title Insurance

Company's Third Party Complaint, by certified mail and regular mail to all counsel listed on the attached as Exhibit A.

3. I hereby certify that the foregoing statements are true. If any of the foregoing statements made by me are willfully false, I am subject to punishment by law.

  
Desirée Jackson  
DESIREE JACKSON

Dated: June 3, 2005

NWK2: 1301837.01

**SERVICE LIST**

**WALSH SECURITIES, INC. V. CRISTO PROPERTY MANAGEMENT, ET AL**  
**CIVIL ACTION NO. 97-3496(WGB)**

Robert A. Magnanini, Esq.  
Boies, Schiller & Flexner LLP  
150 John F. Kennedy  
Short Hills, NJ 07078  
**Attorney for plaintiff Walsh Securities, Inc. and for third-party defendant Robert Walsh**

Ronald M. Kleinberg, Esq.  
Richard A. Finkel, Esq.  
Meissner, Kleinberg & Finkel, LLP  
275 Madison Ave., Suite 1000  
New York, New York 10016  
**Attorney for defendants Cristo Property Management, LTD, DEK Homes of NJ, Inc., Oakwood Properties, Inc., and William J. Kane**

Joseph Sorrentino, Esq.  
404 Manor Road  
Staten Island, New York 10314  
**Attorney for defendants Cristo Property Management, LTD, DEK Homes of NJ, Inc., Oakwood Properties, Inc., and William J. Kane**

Michael Schottland, Esq.  
Schottland, Manning, Rosen, Callendo & Munson, PA  
36 W. Main Street  
Freehold, NJ 07728  
**Attorney for Defendants National Home Funding, Inc. and Robert Skowrenski, II**

Martin R. McGowan, Jr., Esq.  
Methfessel & Werbel  
3 Ethel Road  
Suite 300  
Edison, New Jersey 08818  
**Attorneys for Defendant Coastal Title Agency**

Edward C. Bertucio, Jr., Esq.  
Hobbie, Corrigan, Bertucio & Tashjy, P.C.  
125 Wyckoff Road  
Eatontown, NJ 07724  
**Attorney for Defendant Michael Alfieri, Esq.**

Robert J. Reilly, III, Esq.  
Reilly, Supple & Wischusen, LLC  
571 Central Avenue  
New Providence, NJ 07974  
**Attorney for defendant Michael Alfieri, Esq. on the Sixth Count**

Theodore W. Daunno, Esq.  
1033 Clifton Avenue  
Clifton, New Jersey 07013  
**Attorney for Defendant Lawrence M. Cuzzi**

Mark W. Catanzaro, Esq.  
Blason IV  
Suite 208  
513 Lenola Road  
Moorestown, New Jersey 08057  
**Attorney for defendants Richard Pepsny and Donna Pepsny**

Thomas D. Flinn, Esq.  
Garrity, Graham, Favette & Flinn  
1 Lackawanna Plaza, Box 4205  
Montclair, NJ 07042  
**Attorney for Defendant Anthony M. Ciccalese**

Anthony Argiropoulos, Esq.  
Fox, Rothschild, O'Brien & Frankel  
997 Lenox Drive, Bldg. 3  
Lawrenceville, New Jersey 08648  
**Attorney for Defendants Fidelity National Title Insurance and Nations Title Insurance**

Edward J. Hayes, Jr., Esq.  
Fox, Rothschild, O'Brien & Frankel  
2000 Market Street  
10<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-3291  
**Attorney for Defendants Fidelity National Title Insurance and Nations Title Insurance**

Pasquale Menna, Esq.  
Kauff and Menna  
170 Broad Street  
P.O. 762  
Red Bank, New Jersey 07701  
**Attorneys for defendant Roland J. Pierson**

Frederick Alworth, Esq.  
Gibbons Del Deo Dolan Griffinger & Vecchione, PC  
1 Riverfront Plaza  
Newark, NJ 07102  
**Attorney for defendant Stewart Title Guaranty Company**

John B. McCusker, Esq.  
McCusker Anselmi Rosen Carvelli & Walsh, PC  
127 Main Street  
Chatham, NJ 07928  
**Attorney for defendant Weichert Realtors**

Thomas Brodo, Pro Se  
139B Fort Lee Road  
Teaneck, New Jersey 07666

James R. Brown, Pro Se  
1089 Cedar Avenue  
Union, New Jersey 07083

Richard Calanni, Pro Se  
One Old Farm Road  
Tinton Falls, New Jersey 07724

Anthony D'Apolito, Pro Se  
909 Woodland  
Wall Township, NJ 07719

Richard DiBenedetto, Pro Se  
153 Stephens Lane  
Mahwah, New Jersey 07430

Irene DiFeo, Pro Se  
5 Leann Court  
Old Bridge, NJ 08857

Stanley Yacker, Esq., Pro Se  
33 Broadway, #1  
Ocean Grove, NJ 07756-1397

Capital Assets Property Management, LLC  
10 West Bergen Place  
Red Bank, NJ 07701

Andrew I. Indeck, Esq.  
Scarinci & Hollenbeck, LLC  
1100 Valleybrook Avenue  
P.O. Box 790  
Lyndhurst, NJ 07071

**Attorney for Garden State Indemnity Co. (Legal Malpractice carrier  
for defendant Michael Alfieri)**

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY

|   |                                  |                                |
|---|----------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| WALSH SECURITIES, INC.,                       | :                                |                                |
| v.  | Plaintiff,                       | Civil Action No. 97-3496 (WGB) |
| CRISTO PROPERTY MANAGEMENT, LTD.,<br>et al.,  | :                                | Honorable William G. Bassler   |
|   | Defendants.                      |                                |
| and   | :                                |                                |
| COMMONWEALTH LAND TITLE INSURANCE<br>COMPANY, | :                                |                                |
|   | Defendant/Third Party Plaintiff, |                                |
| v.  | :                                |                                |
| ROBERT WALSH and<br>ELIZABETH ANN DeMOLA,     | :                                |                                |
|   | Third Party Defendants.          |                                |

---

**THIRD PARTY PLAINTIFF COMMONWEALTH LAND TITLE INSURANCE  
COMPANY'S BRIEF IN OPPOSITION TO THIRD PARTY DEFENDANT WEICHERT,  
REALTORS MOTION TO DISMISS, AS IT RELATES TO COMMONWEALTH LAND  
TITLE INSURANCE COMPANY'S THIRD PARTY COMPLAINT**

---

Of Counsel: David R. Kott, Esq.

On the Brief: David R. Kott, Esq.  
Natalie S. Watson, Esq.

David R. Kott, Esq. (DK-4593)  
McCARTER & ENGLISH, LLP  
Four Gateway Center  
100 Mulberry Street  
Newark, New Jersey 07102  
(973) 622-4444  
Attorneys for Defendant/Third-Party  
Plaintiff Commonwealth Land  
and Title Company Insurance  
Company

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

|  |   |
|--|---|
| PRELIMINARY STATEMENT .....  | 2 |
| LEGAL ARGUMENT.....  | 2 |
| POINT I .....  | 2 |
| WEICHERT HAS FAILED TO ASSERT A STATUTE OF<br>LIMITATIONS DEFENSE AGAINST<br>COMMONWEALTH; EVEN IF SHE HAD, SUCH A<br>DEFENSE WOULD FAIL BECAUSE<br>COMMONWEALTH'S CLAIM HAS NOT YET<br>ACCRUED .....    | 2 |
| POINT II .....   | 4 |
| SHOULD THE COURT GRANT WEICHERT'S<br>MOTION TO DISMISS PLAINTIFF'S CLAIMS BASED<br>ON STATUTE OF LIMITATIONS BAR, SUCH A<br>DISMISSAL SHOULD NOT SERVE TO DISMISS<br>CROSS-CLAIMS AGAINST WEICHERT ..... | 4 |
| CONCLUSION.....  | 5 |

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

**FEDERAL CASES**

*Aetna Insurance Co. v. Newton*, 398 F.2d 729 (3d Cir. 1968).....3

*Fairview Park Excavating Co., Inc. v. Al Monzo Construction Co., Inc.*, 560 F.2d 1122 (3d Cir. 1977).....3

*Frommeyer v. L. & R. Construction Co., Inc.*, 139 F. Supp. 579 (D.N.J. 1956) .....3

**STATE CASES**

*Holloway v. State*, 125 N.J. 386 (1991) .....,2

*Markey v. Skog*, 129 N.J. Super. 129 (Law Div. 1974) .....,2

*McGlone v. Corbi*, 59 N.J. 86 (1971) .....,1

*Mettinger v. Globe Slicing Machine Co.*, 153 N.J. 371 (1998) .....,1

*S.P. v. Collier high School*, 319 N.J. Super. 452 (App. Div. 1999).....2

**STATUTES**

NJS 2A:53A-1 et seq. ....,3

**MISCELLANEOUS**

57 ADR 3d 867 at § 3(a).....2

Mahoney, Comparative Fault and Liability Apportionment (GANN, 2005) .....,2

**PRELIMINARY STATEMENT**

We represent the defendant Commonwealth Land Title Insurance Company (hereinafter "Commonwealth") in the above-captioned matter. Weichert, Realtors (hereinafter "Weichert") does not contend that Commonwealth's cross-claims against it run afoul of the statute of limitations. Indeed, claims for contribution and indemnification do not accrue until the recovery of judgment against the third party plaintiff. Consequently, Commonwealth submits this brief to support the contention that any dismissal granted in favor of Weichert should not serve to dismiss the cross-claims against it.

**LEGAL ARGUMENT**

**POINT I**

**WEICHERT HAS FAILED TO ASSERT A STATUTE OF LIMITATIONS DEFENSE AGAINST COMMONWEALTH; EVEN IF SHE HAD, SUCH A DEFENSE WOULD FAIL BECAUSE COMMONWEALTH'S CLAIM HAS NOT YET ACCRUED**

Under New Jersey law, claims for contribution and indemnification do not accrue until the recovery of judgment against the third party plaintiff. McGlone v. Corbi, 59 N.J. 86, 95 (1971); see also Mettinger v. Globe Slicing Mach Co., 153 N.J. 371, 387 (1998); Mahoney, Comparative Fault and Liability Apportionment (GANN, 2005) at 13:2-4. Said another way:

The rule generally recognized is that a claim for contribution . . . does not accrue, and the statute of limitations does not start to run thereon, at the time of the commission of the tort, or of the resulting injury or damage, but from the time of the accrual of the cause of action for contribution, which is at the time of payment of the underlying claim, payment of a judgment thereon, or payment of a settlement thereof, or at the time of other satisfaction or discharge of such claim in whole or in part, to an extent greater

than his pro rata share of the common liability, by the party seeking contribution.

57 ADR 3d 867 at § 3(a). For example, in Mettinger, a distributor sought indemnification and contribution from the successor of the manufacturer of an allegedly defective product. Id. The Mettinger Court held that the distributor's claims for indemnification and contribution against the manufacturer's successor did not accrue until the injured plaintiff obtained a judgment against the distributor. Id. Thus, the distributor's claims were preserved even though the successor did not even come into existence until after the statute of limitations on the underlying product claim had expired. Id.

In Markey v. Skog, 129 N.J. Super. 129, 200-201 (Law Div. 1974), Judge Pressler offers a succinct explanation of the interplay between a defendant's contribution right and the statute of limitations. Holding that a defendant can bring a contribution claim against an alleged joint tortfeasor even if the statute of limitations has run on the plaintiff's claim against that party, Judge Pressler stated:

It is clear that a defendant's right to contribution from a joint tortfeasor is, therefore, an inchoate right which does not ripen into a cause of action until he has paid more than his pro rata portion of the judgment obtained against him by the plaintiff. It is at that point that his cause of action for contribution accrues. . . The assertion by codefendants in a negligence action of a right of contribution inter sese and the right of a defendant to implead a joint tortfeasor by a third-party complaint before plaintiff's cause of action has been reduced to a judgment are merely devices of a procedural convenience afforded by the rules of practice. . .

Id. at 200; accord S.P. v. Collier high School, 319 N.J. Super. 452, 472 (App. Div. 1999); Holloway v. State, 125 N.J. 386, 399 (1991).

In the case at bar, Commonwealth's claim against Weichert is for contribution under the Joint Tortfeasors Contribution Law, N.J.S. 2A:53A-1 et seq. As such, Commonwealth's claim

will not accrue until Walsh secures judgment against Commonwealth. Therefore, Commonwealth's right to contribution from Weichert may not be defeated by Walsh's statute of limitations bar, if such a bar exists.

**POINT II**

**SHOULD THE COURT GRANT WEICHERT'S MOTION  
TO DISMISS PLAINTIFF'S CLAIMS BASED ON STATUTE  
OF LIMITATIONS BAR, SUCH A DISMISSAL SHOULD  
NOT SERVE TO DISMISS CROSS-CLAIMS AGAINST  
WEICHERT**

---

Under Third Circuit law, "dismissal of the original Complaint as to one of the defendants named therein does not operate as a dismissal of a cross-claim filed against such defendant by a co-defendant." Aetna Ins. Co. v. Newton, 398 F.2d 729, 734 (3d Cir. 1968) (internal citations omitted); see also Fronmeyer v. L. & R. Construction Co., Inc., 139 F.Supp. 579, 585-86 (D.N.J. 1956); Fairview Park Excavating Co., Inc. v. Al Monzo Construction Co., Inc., 560 F.2d 1122, 1125-26 (3d Cir. 1977). As discussed above (Point I, supra), Commonwealth's cross-claims for contribution have not yet accrued under New Jersey law and will not accrue until a plaintiff secures judgment against Commonwealth. Furthermore, Weichert has not asserted a statute of limitations defense against Commonwealth's cross-claims. Consequently, Commonwealth respectfully requests that regardless of this Court's decision concerning dismissal of plaintiff's claims against Weichert, any dismissal should not also serve to dismiss Commonwealth's cross-claims against it.

**CONCLUSION**

Therefore, for the reasons set forth above, defendant Commonwealth respectfully requests that regardless of whether the plaintiff's Complaint is dismissed as to any co-defendants, this Court preserve any and all cross-claims filed against the co-defendants by defendant Commonwealth.

Respectfully submitted,

Dated: June 3, 2005

By:

  
David R. Kott, Esq.  
McCARTER & ENGLISH, LLP  
Four Gateway Center  
100 Mulberry Street  
Newark, New Jersey 07101-0652  
(973) 622-4444  
(973) 624-7070 (fax)

NWK2: 1318374.01